Civility: Communicating during Conflict

Kait Flocchini, Assistant Bar Counsel State Bar of Nevada







Introduction

- Prepare yourself
- Understand others

Prepare Yourself: Your Conflict



A recent conflict I had was with [name] about [topic]. I was frustrated because they couldn't see that [my position].

An Issue with Jack

Meet Jack. He is a partner at Grabbit & Runne, a boutique firm in Reno. You are a junior associate for G&R.

Jack has a reputation for being hard nosed and direct. He considers himself tough but fair.



An Issue with Jack

Jack isn't happy with you. He asked for your help on a project, and you haven't been able to dedicate the time to it that he hoped due to your own work commitments. It's a big case for the firm and he prides himself on his success rate.

When asked you to help, he suggested a few hours of work. It's been weeks now and there's no end in sight. Last night he sent you an email...



From: Jack To: Me

Good evening,

We need to talk first thing tomorrow about the ACME case. To be honest, I'm not happy about the level of commitment you are showing to me, the client, and the firm.

Let me know when you are in tomorrow morning, I will come to you.



Prepare Yourself

Your reaction

How would your emotional state be Howe would eenuial acompany state be the next morning? Nervous?

Under attack?

Defensive?



Prepare Y

Your reaction

Low Stakes vs High Stakes



Updated with New Approaches for Today's Communication Challenges **OVER 5 MILLION COPIES SOLD**

crucial conversations



TOOLS FOR TALKING WHEN STAKES ARE HIGH

JOSEPH GRENNY • KERRY PATTERSON • RON McMILLAN AL SWITZLER • EMILY GREGORY

Prepare Yourself: Crucial Conversations



Think back to the conflict you noted earlier in the presentation. In hindsight, was it destined to be a stressful or "crucial conversation?"



Start the presentation to see live content. For screen share software, share the entire screen. Get help at pollev.com/app

Remember Jack?

Jack isn't happy with you. He asked for your help on a project, and you haven't been able to dedicate the time to it that he hoped due to your own work commitments. It's a big case for the firm and he prides himself on his success rate.

Last night he sent you an email...



Updated with New Approaches for Today's Communication Challenges **OVER 5 MILLION COPIES SOLD**

crucial conversations



TOOLS FOR TALKING WHEN STAKES ARE HIGH

JOSEPH GRENNY • KERRY PATTERSON • RON McMILLAN AL SWITZLER • EMILY GREGORY

Prepare Yourself: Crucial Conversations

Ask Yourself:

- What is my goal?
- Can we identify a mutual purpose or shared goal?
- How will I avoid becoming defensive or reactive?

An Issue with Jack

If I don't get this contract done, we're going to lose ACME as a client

ACME isn't important right now. XYZ Corp pays our bills. Why can't you see that?

#1 BESTSELLER DANIEL GOLEMAN

Prepare Yourself: Systems 1 and 2

Prefrontal cortex Medial prefrontal cortex Ventromedial prefrontal cortex Amyqdala



The groundbreaking book that redefines what it means to be smart

Emotional Intelligence

> Why It Can Matter More Than IQ

THE NEW YORK TIMES BESTSELLER

THINKING,

FAST AND SLOW



DANIEL

KAHNEMAN

WINNER OF THE NOBEL PRIZE IN ECONOMICS

"[A] masterpiece . . . This is one of the greatest and most engaging collections of insights into the human mind I have read." — WILLIAM EASTERLY, *Financial Times*

Prepare Yourself: Systems 1 and 2

- System 1 is automatic and impulsive.
- It enables you to make quick decisions with heuristics or mental shortcuts.
- But those shortcuts result in cognitive biases
- System 1 is a remnant from our past, and it's crucial to our survival. We don't have to think before jumping away from danger.

THINKING,

FAST AND SLOW



DANIEL

KAHNEMAN

WINNER OF THE NOBEL PRIZE IN ECONOMICS

"[A] masterpiece . . . This is one of the greatest and most engaging collections of insights into the human mind I have read." — WILLIAM EASTERLY, *Financial Times*

Prepare Yourself: Systems 1 and 2

- System 2 is very conscious, aware and considerate.
- It exerts self-control and focus.
- Think about that brain teaser on the LSAT.
- System 2 is one of the most 'recent' additions to our brain and only a few thousand years old. We shifted from worrying about food and shelter to earning money, supporting a family, and complex decisions.
- However, these 2 systems often fight over who's in charge and this conflict affects how you respond to others.

THE NEW YORK TIMES BESTSELLER

THINKING,

FAST AND SLOW



DANIEL

KAHNEMAN

WINNER OF THE NOBEL PRIZE IN ECONOMICS

"[A] masterpiece . . . This is one of the greatest and most engaging collections of insights into the human mind I have read." — WILLIAM EASTERLY, *Financial Times*

Prepare Yourself: Systems 1 and 2

- Your brain is lazy.
- It defaults to system 1 to conserve energy.
- But you make intellectual errors in system 1.
- When system 1 can't solve a difficult problem, it calls system 2 into action.







What is 32 x 12?



Prepare Yourself: Systems 1 and 2



Think back to your conflict. Did you use:



#1 BESTSELLER DANIEL GOLEMAN

The groundbreaking book that redefines what it means to be smart

Emotional Intelligence

> Why It Can Matter More Than IQ

Prepare Yourself: Amygdala Hijack

AccommodateAttack

Avoid



#1 BESTSELLER DANIEL GOLEMAN

The groundbreaking book that redefines what it means to be smart

Emotional Intelligence

> Why It Can Matter More Than IQ

Prepare Yourself: Amygdala Hijack



- Breathe
- Focus on you body
- Say a mantra
- Label how you feel
- Take a break

An Issue with Jack

If I don't get this contract done, we're going to lose ACME as a client

ACME isn't important right now. XYZ Corp pays our bills. Why can't you see that?

What is your default system 1 response in a professional setting?

Accommodate: Apologize and work longer hours.

Attack: Accuse him of a bait and switch ploy in the amount of work.

Avoid: Tell him you have back-to-back meetings today and can't meet.

0%

0%

0%

Prepare: Your default response Was your reaction justified?
Is compromise or collaboration an option?

Recognize and label your reaction



Position vs

Interests

Position

Your stance on a topic

I need two weeks to finish this contract.

Interests

Your underlying desired outcome or reasons for the stance

I want to my work to be accurate to mitigate risk.

Position

Your stance on a topic

Interests

Your underlying desired outcome or reasons for the stance

<u>Consider your conflict:</u>

- What were your interests?
- Could you have expressed your position better?
- Was there a mutual interest?

Remember Jack?

Before meeting Jack, take a moment to identify mutual interests.

- Promotions at the firm are relationship driven. You and Jack both want a strong relationship.
- Conflict will mark both of your reputations.
- This case is difficult, but also prestigious. A successful result would benefit you both.



That's not how we do it around here.

This is due today!

Prepare: Understand Others

My team is swamped. We cannot take on more. This needs to be reviewed and approved.

The art of conversation lies in listening.

Malcolm Forbes

Listening Self Reflective Quiz

	Frequently	Occasionally	Rarely
I have a hard time letting others explain fully without interrupting.	3	2	1
I often think people could "get to the point" much faster.	3	2	1
I finish sentences for other people.	3	2	1
I continue the task at hand and do not turn my full attention to the other person when they approach me and start talking.	3	2	1
I am caught not knowing what to say because I wasn't paying attention.	3	2	1
I anticipate what others will say and jump ahead of them in conversation.	3	2	1
How are you at listening?









Ignorer/Pretend Listener 0 to 6

Selective Listener 7 to 12

Attentive Listener 13 to 17 Active Listener

Understanding Others: Listening Skills

Body Language

- Lower your voice.
- Incline toward the speaker, but respect personal space.
- Square up.
- Establish eye contact.

Ask Questions

- Open-ended questions like "Tell me more about that ..."
- Ask why a stance is important.
- Ask for additional information. What do they know that you don't?

Paraphrase

- Express your understanding
- "Let me see if I understand correctly..."
- "Do you mean ..."
- "Are you saying ... "

Understanding Others: Listening Skills

Recognize Feelings

- Validate their feelings.
- "I understand why you are frustrated."
- "If I were in your shoes, I would feel the same way."

Summarize

- Make sure you and the speaker have a mutual understanding.
- "I now understand your concerns. I agree that raising the issue with the judge would be the best way to proceed."
- "In summary, we all agree that ..."

Understanding Others: Listening Skills

Consider your conflict. Did you ...

- Demonstrate interest and sincerity with attentive body language?
- Inquire about the speaker's perspective?
- Paraphrase the speaker's words?
- Validate the speaker's feelings?
- Summarize and restate the main themes of the conversation?

Understanding Others: The 3 Whys



Understanding Others: The 3 Whys

Hi Gina I'm frustrated with I wonder if they aren't thinking that far ahead. I'm going to sit down with them and go through the numbers.

Okay. Why haven't they done the math and realized that themselves?





Wisdom is the reward you get for a lifetime of listening when you would rather have talked.

- Aristotle

Understanding Others: Practice with Jack

Be intentional in how you recognize and manage potentially difficult conversations.



Summary

Prepare

- Identify crucial conversations early
- Recognize your system 1 default
- Identify your interests, not position

Understand

- Uncover the other side's interests
- Use listening skills
- Use the 3 whys to uncover more











Kait Flocchini

kaitf@nvbar.org



Thank you

The Art of Online Legal Research

Or, how your Supreme Court of Nevada Law Library card is the key to lots of resources from wherever you do legal research and whether ChatGPT will conquer the world.

All about me

- 30+ years as a law librarian!
- B.A. Colorado College (Colorado Springs, CO), M.S.L.S. Catholic University of America (Washington, D.C.), J.D. from Lincoln Memorial University (Knoxville, TN)
- 7 states
- 4 "big law" law firm libraries
- 2 academic law libraries
- 1 federal agency (EPA)
- 1 Supreme Court!! (always save the best for last)

Agenda

- Resources available from the law library remotely!
- New features from Bloomberg Law, Lexis+, and Westlaw Precision
- Artificial Intelligence & ChatGPT

Legislative histories, 50-State Surveys, etc. Things you already know...





Chat Currently Offline

LAW LIBRARY CLOSURES

- September 4
- September 29*
- October 25* & 26*
- October 27

*The law library's physical space will be closed but our Reference services are still available by phone, chat, or email.

ACCESS TO THE LAW LIBRARY

- Unvaccinated visitors to the Nevada Supreme Court building are required to wear an appropriate mask at all times while inside Court facilities.
- · Entrance to the Nevada Supreme Court building is ONLY through the Carson Street (west) ground level entrance.
- A Marshal will perform a security check on all visitors and confirm that the visitors are here to use the Law Library for legal information/research, access to legal forms, or to make use of a conference room.

6

• ADA parking is only available in the Stewart Street parking lot. Disabled visitor's needing entrance from the Stewart Street side of the building should contact the Law Library by phone or email prior to their visit to make arrangements for accommodations for the security check.

ASK A LIBRARIAN

- Walk-in & Phone: (775) 684-1640 Monday Friday, 8:00 am 5:00 pm (except state holidays)
- Chat with a Librarian Monday Friday, 9:00 am 4:00 pm (except state holidays)
- Email Us: <u>Reference@nvcourts.nv.gov</u> (we will respond during normal business hours)

50-State Surveys ()

About the Nevada Supreme Court Law Library How to Locate the Law: A Guide to Locating Nevada Law and Legal Resources Justice James W. Hardesty Collection & Creation of the Nevada Court of Appeals (Nevada Administrative Code (NAC) Research Guide 🚯 Nevada Administrative Docket (ADKT) User Guide 🚯 Nevada Case Law Research Guide 🚯 Nevada Citation Guide 🚯 Nevada County and Municipal Codes () Nevada Eviction & Foreclosure Guide () Nevada Judicial Historical Society Nevada Law Libraries 🚯 Nevada Legislative History Nevada Primary Sources () Nevada Reports Comparative Tables (1988-present) Nevada Statutory Derivation ()

Nevada Supreme Court Law Library: LexisNexis Digital Library

Need a guide on a specific topic?

Please let us know!

reference@nvcourts.nv.gov



Nevada Supreme Court Law Library

Nevada Supreme Court Law Library / LibGuides / Nevada Supreme Court Law Library JUDICIARY / 50-State Surveys / Existing Surveys

50-State Surveys

Search this Guide Search

The purpose of this guide is to provide guidance on determining the law on a particular subject across all 50 states (statutory, regulatory, or case law).

Existing Surveys

Existing Surveys

Existing 50 State Statutory and Regulatory Surveys Westlaw Edge 50-State Surveys

Statutory & Regulatory

National Survey of State Laws (accessible through HeinOnline)

National Conference of State Legislatures Bill Tracking Database

HeinOnline Subject Compilation of State Laws (Statutory and Case Law)

American Law Reports (ALR) Case Law Compilations

Uniform & Model Laws

Lexis+ State Law Comparison Tool

Bloomberg Law Chart Builders

Do It Yourself

Do-It-Yourself - Jurisdictional Surveys on Westlaw Edge (Statutory & Federal Regulatory)

Search the Nevada Supreme Court Law Library Catalog

Keyword	~	Search
---------	---	--------



Westlaw Edge 50-State Surveys Statutory & Regulatory

Existing 50 State Statutory and Regulatory Surveys

In the Westlaw search bar, begin typing 50 State and autofill will lead you to suggested Content Pages (usually near the bottom).

REUTERS	
LAW EDGE 🕏	
50 state	
Suggestions	More -
Cases	
	Content Pages
	50 State Surveys
	50 State Regulatory Surveys
	50 State Statutory Surveys
	50 State Surveys - Tax
	50 State Surveys - Labor & Employment



If a survey does not already exist, you can create your own survey, with a little help from Westlaw's Jurisdictional Surveys.

There are two ways to use this service:

1. When you have the citation or text of a statute in one state and want to find similar statutes in other states, click the icon that looks like a price tag.



2. Alternatively, you can initiate this type of search directly from the Westlaw Edge home page.

- · First, select the Tools tab.
- Select Jurisdictional Surveys.
 - · Enter a statute's citation, or
 - Search for index terms (the search box will offer suggestions of words based on pre-defined index terms). or
 - · Browse by topic and add terms.
 - There is also an option to review a list of existing 50-state surveys for the topic selected (see above for Existing Westlaw surveys).

If you need to contact Westlaw, reach out to their Government Customer Service team at statesupport@thomsonreuters.com.

Both NRS 197.190 4 WA NRS 199.280 MT ME ND WI SD N١ MI WY NE IN VA MO ~ TN AZ NM GA AL MS LA AK (III) CT DE DC MD MA NH NJ RI VT Federal Select a jurisdiction Ŧ

50 State Survey - Similar to NRS 197.190 & NRS 199.280

	NEVADA JUDICIARY	NEVADA APPELLATE COURTS	ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICE OF THE COUR	TS STATE OF NEVADA CONTACT
SUPREME COURT OF NEVADA			Start	your search here Q
About the Library ∨	Legal Research ∨ Forms	s Catalog		

LAW LIBRARY CLOSURES

- September 4
- September 29*
- October 25* & 26*
- October 27

*The law library's physical space will be closed but our Reference services are still available by phone, chat, or email.

ACCESS TO THE LAW LIBRARY

- . Unvaccinated visitors to the Nevada Supreme Court building are required to wear an appropriate mask at all times while inside Court facilities.
- Entrance to the Nevada Supreme Court building is ONLY through the Carson Street (west) ground level entrance.
- A Marshal will perform a security check on all visitors and confirm that the visitors are here to use the Law Library for legal information/research, access to legal forms, or to make use of a conference room.
- ADA parking is only available in the Stewart Street parking lot. Disabled visitor's needing entrance from the Stewart Street side of the building should contact the Law Library by phone or email prior to their visit to make arrangements for accommodations for the security check.

ASK A LIBRARIAN

- Walk-in & Phone: (775) 684-1640 Monday Friday, 8:00 am 5:00 pm (except state holidays)
- Chat with a Librarian Monday Friday, 9:00 am 4:00 pm (except state holidays)
- Email Us: <u>Reference@nvcourts.nv.gov</u> (we will respond during normal business hours)



Keywords

ADVANCED SEARCH

~

QUICK LINKS

Law Library Web Site **Research Guides** Frequently Asked Questions Get a Library Card Nevada Appellate Courts State of Nevada Self-Help Center

ASK A LIBRARIAN

reference@nvcourts.nv.gov (775) 684-1640 (we will respond during normal business hours)

HOURS

8:00 am - 5:00 pm Monday - Friday (except state holidays)

9:00 am - 4:00 pm Monday - Friday (except state holidays)

LIBRARY CLOSURES

- September 4
- September 29*
- October 25* & 26*
- October 27

*The law library's physical space will be closed but our Reference services are still available by phone, chat, or email.

ACCESS TO THE LAW LIBRARY

- · Unvaccinated visitors to the Nevada Supreme Court building are required to wear an appropriate mask at all times while inside Court facilities.
- Entrance to the Nevada Supreme Court building is ONLY through the Carson Street (west) ground level entrance.
- A Marshal will perform a security check on all visitors and confirm that the visitors are here to use the Law Library for legal information/research, access to legal forms, or to make use of a conference room.
- ADA parking is only available in the Stewart Street parking lot. Disabled visitor's needing entrance from the Stewart Street side of the building should contact the Law Library by phone or email prior to their visit to make arrangements for accommodations for the security check.

Making an Appellate Argument







Home > Details for: Nevada civil practice manual /

	Normal view MARC view
	Nevada civil practice manual / State Bar of Nevada Publications Committee ; lead editor,
	Tracy DiFillippo ; editors, Michelle Alarie and 4 others.
Nevada Civil Practice Manual	Contributor(s): Alarie, Michelle [editor.] DiFillippo, Tracy [editor.] State Bar of Nevada. Publications Committee
and the second s	Publisher: New York, NY : LexisNexis, [2016]-
Encern	Edition: Sixth Edition
	Description: 2 volumes (loose-leaf) : forms ; 24 cm
Local course images	ISBN: 1522117687 (print) 9781522117681 (print)
Local cover image	Subject(s): Civil procedure Nevada Forms Civil procedure Nevada

Online resources: Click here to access online

List(s) this item appears in: Popular LexisNexis Digital Library Resources



Item type	Current library $_{\varphi}$	Collection $_{\diamond}$	Shelving location $_{\diamondsuit}$	Call number $_{\diamond}$	Vol info \diamond	Status 🔶 Date due	¢
Reference	Nevada Supreme Court Law Library	READYREF	REFDESK	REF DESK KFN1130 .A75 .N4 2016 (Browse shelf)	v.1	Not For Loan Map it	
Reference	Nevada Supreme Court Law Library		LASVEGAS	LV REFERENCE KFN1130 .A75 .N4 2016 (Browse shelf)	v.1	AVAILABLE Map it	
Reference	Nevada Supreme Court Law Library	REFERENCE	NORTHEAST	REFERENCE KFN1130 .A75 .N4	v.1 c.2	Unavailable for check out	

vada civil practice manual	0
🖸 zoom in 🛛 🖨 zoom out 🛛 🕂 entire map	
	This pin 9 indicates your item's location on map
Supreme Court Of Nevada	Directions:
T → Elevator → Stairs III Restrooms	Please make your way to the Main Flo of the Supreme Court of Nevada Law Library.
	This item is in the following Collection:
Office Statements Rivers	NORTHEAST
	Go to the row labelled:
Btudy Carels	8B
Public Patron Computers,	Look for this item:
Rave Scaner & Printer Reading Raves	REFERENCE KFN1130 .A75 .N4 2010
	v.2 c.2
Contensity Rocin 103	Shareable map
Becured Entrance	
	Powered by StackMap

ASK A LIBRARIAN

<

- Walk-in & Phone: (775) 684-1640 Monday Friday, 8:00 am 5:00 pm (except state holidays)
- Chat with a Librarian Monday Friday, 9:00 am 4:00 pm (except state holidays)
- Email Us: <u>Reference@nvcourts.nv.gov</u> (we will respond during normal business hours)



. Wolters Kluwer



Nevada Supreme Court Law Library

Search this Guide

Search

Nevada Supreme Court Law Library / LibGuides / About the Nevada Supreme Court Law Library / Legal Research Databases

About the Nevada Supreme Court Law Library

Welcome to the Law Library! Learn all about our resources and services, and we hope to see you in the library one day.

Welcome to the Law Library!	Legal Research Databases
Accessing the Law Library	The NSCLL offers visitors access to several legal research services that are only accessible onsite at the Law Library.
ibrary Services	• HeinOnline
Our Collection	Historical content, law journals & reviews, state session laws, etc. Access onsite at the law library.
egal Research Databases	Lexis+ State and federal primary and secondary sources, Shepard's, and Practical Guidance. Access onsite at the law library.
Legal Research Databases	Westlaw Edge
eBook Collections	State and federal primary and secondary sources, KeyCite, and Practical Law. Access onsite at the law library.
Other Library Research Resources	See also the section on Accessing the Law Library in this guide.
ow to Get a Library Card	eBook Collections
onference Rooms	LexisNexis Digital Library
inting & Scanning in the Library	eBooks published by LexisNexis an other titles available through OverDrive. Login with your library account/bar code. If you're asked for the library's co
omputers, WiFi, and the Typewriter	it's NVCOURTS.
anctions	ProView (Thomson Reuter) Ebooks published by Thomson Reuters. Available onsite at the Law Library.
arch the Nevada Supreme Court Law rary Catalog	West Academic Hornbooks and Nutshells series. Available onsite at the Law Library. VitalLaw

Keyword	~	Search

Reserve a Room

Reserve a Room -

Legal news, expert analysis, and treatises in the following Practice Areas: COVID-19, Elder & Estates Law, Family Law, Intellectual Property, Labor & Employment Law, Litigation, Payroll & Entitlements, Pension & Employee Benefits, Practice of Law, Products Liability & Insurance, Property & Construction Law, Securities (including Corporation Law & Governance and Federal & International), and Sexual Harassment & Workplace Compliance. Available onsite at the Law Library.

Need assistance with an eBook? Please contact the Reference Desk.

Don't have a library card? Register for an account/barcode.

Get a library card!



Enter your organization's library code

Library code NVCOURTS





Sign in

Nevada State Employee Access

V

۲

Library Card or Username 29951000001817

Password

SIGN IN

Get help with your login credentials





was fully founded upon the doctrine of prior appropriation.

The Court further found that the public trust doctrine existed in the United States, and agreed that such doctrine also applied in Nevada. However, the Court ruled that the public trust doctrine does not apply to water previously adjudicated under the longstanding doctrine of prior appropriation. The court held We therefore reaffirm that the public trust doctrine applies in Nevada. We also clarify that it applies to rights previously settled under prior appropriation and clarify that the doctrine applies to all waters in the state and the lands submerged beneath navigable waters.

The court further stated:

Х

Although we recognize that the public trust doctrine applies to prior appropriated rights and that the doctrine has always inhered in Nevada's water law, we hold that Nevada's comprehensive water statutes are already consistent with the public trust doctrine because they (1) constrain water allocations based on the public interest and (2) satisfy all of the elements of the dispensation of public trust property that we established in *Lawrence. See* <u>127 Nev. at 405, 245 P.3 da t616</u>.

The above quotations are based upon existing and long-standing laws that require the State Engineer to consider environmental, future growth and public interest issues pursuant to $\underline{NRS \\ § 533.370 (3)(e)-(d)}$.

Inasmuch as the existing statutory law includes the public trust doctrine, and does not allow the reallocation of adjudicated water rights, the Court was not required to answer Question No. 2 concerning compensation of "water taken." The conclusion is that Nevada's water law includes the public trust doctrine, as that doctrine must be considered by the State Engineer when acting upon applications to appropriate or applications to change. <u>NRS § 533.370</u>. «Pt. XI-«Subot. B+•]»:A•«II»

4 Waters and Water Rights I.A.11 (2023)

11. Violation of Water Law or Willful Waste of Water.

Beginning July 1, 2007, the State Engineer has the authority, after notice and opportunity for a hearing, to impose an administrative fine up to \$10,000 per day on any person who violates any provision of Nevada's water laws or regulations, or any permit, certificate, order or decision issued by the State Engineer. <u>NRS § 533.481(1)(a)</u>; <u>NRS § 534.193(1)</u>. The amount of the penalty assessed is based on: (1) the gravity of the violation, (2) any attempts to comply prior to the violation, (3) history of prior violations, and (4) the economic benefit of the violation. Additionally, if a person engages in the unauthorized use or diversion of water, or willful waste of water, the State Engineer may require that person to replace up to 200 percent of the water used, diverted, or wasted. <u>NRS § 533.481(1)(b)</u>. Prior to July 2007, a misdemeanor was the only consequence for violating any provision of the water law, and thus, the change in the law significantly increases the State Engineer's ability to control the unlawful use and waste of water. The State Engineer has promulgated regulations, (LCB File R024-08) effective September 18, 2008, regarding the ability to impose fines and require replacement

of water. Under the regulations, the State Engineer may issue a warning letter or commence an enforcement action. In the former case, the State Engineer will notify the person of the violation and request corrective action. In the latter case, the State Engineer will issue a finding of alleged violation and issue a violation order. The finding of alleged violation will set forth the alleged violation and any facts that support the allegation. The violation order will specify a deadline in which the person must (1) comply with the requirements of the finding of alleged violation, (2) submit a mitigation plan to the State Engineer, (3) meet with the State Engineer's staff to show cause why the State Engineer should not seek injunctive relief, and (4) submit any other information relating to the violation. The person subject to the finding of alleged violation and enforcement order may request a hearing before an independent advisory committee composed of members of the State Engineer's staff to review the finding and order. The State Engineer will issue a final decision after the hearing, which may be appealed to the district court.

Finally, the 2007 amendments to the water law allow the State Engineer to seek injunctive relief to prevent any violation contemplated above. <u>NRS § 533.482(1)</u>. Under this statute, the State Engineer is only required to show that a person is engaged, or is about to engage in any act that is considered a violation as described above. <u>NRS § 533.482(2)</u>. Further, the State Engineer does not have to show lack of an adequate remedy at law or irreparable harm. <u>NRS § 533.482(3)</u>. «Pt. XI-«Subpt. B-u)»A-«12»

4 Waters and Water Rights I.A.12 (2023) 12. Water Rights as Real Property Interests.

2. water reights as real i roperty interests

Water rights in Nevada are clearly defined as interests in real property. In re Lompa, 88 Nev. 541, 501 P.2d 662 (1972). A water right is therefore transferred via a deed or other instrument of conveyance. Transfers or assignments of water rights are specifically authorized by NRS § 533.383, with the State Engineer's office being the repository of deeds. Additionally, in a recent decision the Nevada Supreme Court clarified that water rights are freely alienable property interests that can be conveyed independently of the real property on which they are permitted to be used, and that the anti-speculation doctrine does not limit the ability of a party to acquire a security or ownership interest in water rights separately from the land to which they are placed to beneficial use. Adaven Mgt., Inc. v. Mt. Falls Acquisition Corp., 124 Nev. 770, 191 P.3d 1189 (2008). First, the Court held that NRS § 533.040 does not prohibit a person from transferring water rights separately from the land to which they are appurtenant, either by conveying them in trust as security or selling them outright. The Court concluded that transferring water rights separately from the land does not alter where the water rights could be placed to beneficial use, and thus, does not require the State Engineer's approval under NRS § 533.040. Id. at 777, 193 P.3d at 1196. Second, the Court concluded that the anti-speculation doctrine, which "precludes speculative water right acquisitions without a showing of beneficial use," does not



T

A REPORT	Q nevada	× SEARCH		My account
SUPREME COURT OF NEVADA Law Library	My books			
Home Home	Filters =		Q Find	
My books My annotations	History 11 Shared 0 Borrowed 1 Downloaded 5 Holds 0			
 Export queue My tags 	Contract Templates for Nevada Attorneys Publications Committee of the State Bar of Nevada Dublications Committee of the State Bar of Nevada			
	Nevada Civil Practice Manual Volume 1 State Bar of Nevada Edition 6 Release date 11/09/2022		You've borrowed this title. It expires 09/08/2023. You can return this title early if you're done with it. RETURN	2MB)

FEATURED CONTENT



The following titles are included in your eBook collection:

- 2020 Nevada PSI Real Estate Exam Prep Questions & Answers
- Contract Templates for Nevada Attorneys
- CSC[®] Nevada Laws Governing Business
- Entities AnnotatedMichie's Nevada Revised Statutes
- AnnotatedMichie's Nevada Revised Statutes
- Annotated: Court Rules Annotated
- Nevada Advance Code Service
- Nevada Appellate Practice Manual
- Nevada Business Entities
- Nevada Cannabis Laws and Regulations
- Nevada Civil Practice Manual
- Nevada Gaming Law Practice and Procedure Manual
- Nevada Jury Instructions
- Nevada Jury Instructions Civil (2011)
- Nevada Marijuana Laws and Regulations
- Nevada Real Estate License Exam Prep
- Nevada Real Estate Manual
- Nevada Real Property Practice and Procedure Manual
- 100+ Pointers for Business Development
- 100+ Pointers for New Lawyers on Adjusting to Your Job
- 101+ Practical Solutions for the Family Lawyer
- 2010 ABA Legal Technology Survey Report
- 2013 ABA Legal Technology Survey Report
- 2013 Review of Consumer Protection Law Developments
- 2014 ABA Legal Technology Survey Report
- 2017 Annual Review of Antitrust Law

- A Lawyer's Guide to the Alexander Technique
- A Lawyer's Guide to Working with Special Needs Clients
- A Lawyer's Journey
- A Legal Guide to Enterprise Mobile Device Management
- A Legal Strategist's Guide to Trademark Trial and Appeal Board Practice
- A Litigator's Guide to Building Your Best Argument
- A Litigator's Guide to Convincing the Judge
- A Litigator's Guide to Expert Witnesses
- A Manual of Style for Contract Drafting
- A Practical Guide to Commercial Real Estate Transactions
- A Practical Guide to Cyber Insurance for Businesses
- A Practical Guide to Disputes Between Adjoining Landowners—Easements
- A Practical Guide to Organizational Ombuds
- A Practical Guide to Software Licensing for Licensees and Licensors
- A Practical Guide to Winning Land Use Approvals and Permits
- A Practical Handbook for the Child's Attorney
- A Practitioner's Guide to Class Actions
- A Practitioner's Guide to FINRA Sanctions Analysis
- A Practitioner's Guide to Real Estate and Wind Energy Project Development
- A Short & Happy Guide to Bitcoin, Blockchain, and Crypto

- ADR Advocacy, Strategies, and Practice for Intellectual Property Cases
 - Advertising Claim Substantiation Handbook
 - Advising the Small Business
- Age Discrimination Litigation
- Aging in Prison

.

.

.

.

.

- Agriculture and Food Handbook
- Al For Lawyers
- Alaska Statutes
- Alternative Dispute Resolution in State and Local Governments
- Alternative Fees for Business Lawyers and Their Clients
- Al-Tounsi
- America Votes!
- American Contagions
- American Law Firms in Transition
- American Law of Mining
- American Lawyers
- Americans with Disabilities Act
- An Attorney's Guide to ERISA Disability Claims
- An Estate Planner's Guide to Buy-Sell Agreements for the Closely Held Business
- An Estate Planner's Guide to Family Business Entities
- An International Guide to Corporate Internal Investigations
- An Introduction to Law Firm Practice
- An Introductory Guide to Artificial Intelligence for Legal Professionals
- An Island Apart
- Anatomy of a Confession
- Anatomy of a Mortgage



Agenda

- Resources available from the law library remotely!
- New features from Bloomberg Law, Lexis+, and Westlaw Precision

The law library is so much more than books & ebooks...



Artificial Intelligence &

Bloomberg Law Lexis+ AI Westlaw Precision

Rule 1.1 Competence

A lawyer shall provide competent representation to a client. Competent representation requires the legal knowledge, skill, thoroughness and preparation reasonably necessary for the representation.



NBA

ABA/Bloomberg Law Lawyers' Manual on Professional Conduct

Legal Ethics News

IRS Sanctioned by Court for 'Bad Faith' on Backdated Document

California Judicial Council Buzz Kill: No Partying With Lawyers

Hollywood Designer Sues Erika Jayne Claiming Shifty AmEx Usage

MORE >

Professional Perspectives

Legal Profession, Professional Perspective - Tech Competence From the Courtroom to Cyberspace

Legal Profession, Professional Perspective - Time to Renew America's Lawyer Discipline System

Legal Profession, Professional Perspective - Identifying the Client When Probating an Estate

MORE >

Recent Practice Guide Updates

Citation Style Guide

ABA Ethics Opinions, Formal Opinion 507 July 12, 2023, Office Sharing Arrangements with Other Lawyers ABA Ethics Opinions, Formal Opinion 506 June 7, 2023, Responsibilities Regarding Nonlawyer Assistants ABA Ethics Opinions, Formal Opinion 505 May 3, 2023, Fees Paid in Advance for Contemplated Services

MORE >


Books & Treatises

Supreme Court Practice

Chapter 2. Jurisdiction to Review Decisions of Federal Courts

BNA, Supreme Court Practice, Chapter 2. Jurisdiction to Review Decisions of Federal Courts

^

R

NOTEPAD



A third of Americans say they read both print and digital books in the past year

% of U.S. adults who say they have read _____ in the previous 12 months



Note: The "digital books" category includes both e-books and audiobooks.

Source: Survey conducted Jan. 25-Feb. 8, 2021.

PEW RESEARCH CENTER



THOMSON REUTERS PROVIEW LIBRARY QUICK TIP: C RECENT ACTIVITY Family Law Sutherland To add a Note, select the text you wish to Statutes and (The Rutter STATUTES AND STATUTORY ONSTRUCTION comment on, select "Add Note" from the Grou ... ractice Sta popup menu, type your note, and choose a struction. Guide), 2023 color label. 2022-2023 update 6 6 Sort By: Title Administrative Law and Age Discrimination, 2d, 2023 ALI Principles of the Law o ... Alternative Dispute Resolut ... Practice, 3d, 2023 update ecommendations, 2023 update Practice Guide, 2023 update update The Late CHARLES H. KOCH, JR. Howard C. Eglit The American Law Institute Bette J. Roth. Randall W. Wulff. Charles RICHARD MURPHY A. Cooper GE 图 5 图 9 图4 断 5 0 0 0 0 Alternative Dispute American Law of Medical American Land Planning Law, American Law of Torts, 2023 Superseded Resolution, 4th, 2022-2023 2021 update Malpractice, 3d, 2023 update update Stuart M. Speiser, Charles F. Krause, Alfred W. Gans, Monique C. M. Leahy By Jay E. Grenig Norman Williams, Jr., John M. Taylor Steven E. Pegalis, J.D. RESOLUTION Paul, Const **IN 5** 图 3 断5 BN 9 0 0 0 0 Anti-SLAPP Litigation (The ... ation Series), 2022 update. American Law of Zoning, 5th, Antitrust Adviser, 5th, 2022 Architects and Engineers, 2023-1 update 2023 ed. update a Longerine Stear Patricia E. Salkin Thomas R. Burke Irving Scher, Scott Martin Annette Davis Perrochet, James Acret ANTI-SLAPP LITIGATION **BN 9** 图3 圖 5 图 5 0 0 0 0 Arizona Rules of Court- State, Attorney Fee Awards, 3d (Tr ... Attorney-Client Privilege i ... d Attorneys' Fees, 3d, 2023 tice Series), 2023-1 update 2023 States, 2022-2023 Edition update ARIZONA RULES OF COURT Alba Conte, Esq. Paul R. Rice, Contributing Authors:, Robert L. Rossi Kevin T. Barnett, I. Richard Gershon,



....

C Lexis+



Practical Guidance



Litigation Analytics



Brief Analysis



Legal News Hub

What would you like to research today?

Ι garnishment massachusetts garnishment act Documents california wage garnishment law tennessee personal property owner's rights and garnishment act district of columbia wage garnishment fairness amendment act of 2018 7 8 9 Psara Energy v. Attachment & Garnishment 12 Space Shipping, 2020 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 119320 Legal Phrases garnishment garnishment counterclaim garnishment exemptions garnishment employer garnishment commingle What is the definition of equitable garnishment? Suggested What is the definition of exemptions from garnishment? Questions What is the definition of garnishment? What is the definition of ancillary garnishment? What is the definition of garnishment bonds?

Client



Agenda

- Resources available from the law library remotely!
- New features from Bloomberg Law, Lexis+, and Westlaw Precision
- Artificial Intelligence and ChatGPT

Rule 1.1 Competence

A lawyer shall provide competent representation to a client. Competent representation requires the legal knowledge, skill, thoroughness and preparation reasonably necessary for the representation.

Artificial Intelligence

- Extractive AI Finds relevant results within existing data
 - Lexis & Westlaw Answers
 - Fact and Issue Finder (Lexis)
 - Westlaw Precision
- Generative AI **Creates** new content from existing data
 - Lexis+ Al Video
 - Lexis Judicial Brief Analysis
 - Westlaw Casetext CoCounsel Chat PDF
- All require human review

Ethics (Attorneys vs. SRLs)

- Rule 1.1 likely not an attorney issue
- Good news: if a self-represented litigant uses ChatGPT, it should be obvious
- <u>Al Terminology for Legal Information</u>
 <u>Professionals</u>

Ethics (and hallucinations)

The New York Times The Risk of Generative Al Without Guardrails

Here's What Happens When Your Lawyer Uses ChatGPT



The lawsuit began like so many others: A man named Roberto Mata sued the airline Avianca, saying he was injured when a metal serving cart struck his knee during a flight to Kennedy International Airport in New York.

There was just one hitch: No one — not the airline's lawyers, not even the judge himself — could find the decisions or the quotations cited and summarized in the brief.

That was because ChatGPT had invented everything.

effect of the automatic stay on a statute of limitations.

There was just one hitch: No one — not the airline's lawyers, not even the judge himself — could find the decisions or the quotations cited and summarized in the brief.

That was because ChatGPT had invented everything.

The lawyer who created the brief, Steven A. Schwartz of the firm Levidow, Levidow & Oberman, threw himself on the mercy of the court on Thursday, saying in an affidavit that he had used the artificial intelligence program to do his legal research — "a source that has revealed itself to be unreliable."

Recommendations

- Judge Castel walked Schwartz through his faulty brief, asking whether he'd thought to check the cases on legal research databases, in books at a law library, or even on Google. Schwartz's answer each time was "no."
- The judge asked Schwartz whether he was suspicious of one of the main phony cases cited in the brief, the non-existent "Varghese v. China South Airlines Co.," which the judge said included information that made no sense.
- "Can we agree that is legal gibberish?" Castel asked.

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

STANDING ORDER RE: ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE ("AI") IN CASES ASSIGNED TO JUDGE BAYLSON

If any attorney for a party, or a *pro se* party, has used Artificial Intelligence ("AI") in the preparation of any complaint, answer, motion, brief, or other paper, filed with the Court, and assigned to Judge Michael M. Baylson, **MUST**, in a clear and plain factual statement, disclose that AI has been used in any way in the preparation of the filing, and **CERTIFY**, that each and every citation to the law or the record in the paper, has been verified as accurate.

2

DATED: 6/6/2023

BY THE COURT:

/s/ MICHAEL M. BAYLSON

MICHAEL M. BAYLSON, U.S.D.J.

Artificial Intelligence Timeline



3

Expected Effect of AI on Line of Work, by Generation



Q13: In the coming years, do you think AI will have a positive or negative impact on your line of work? (Select one) Total n=642; Source: Aberdeen, March 2023



Home > Opinions > AI

Why AI Is the Nemesis of Truth Itself

AI isn't going to take over the world. It probably won't even to take your job. The real threat is far more insidious—the AI boom heralds the erosion of truth and fact, and it's already happening.



By <u>Neil J. Rubenking</u> July 31, 2023 🦸 🛒 🖬 🚥



Lexis+ AI

JOIN NOM

Search

Summarize Draft

Trending Al Principles



Al Search That Interacts

Conversational Search

Interact with Lexis+ AI like you would a trusted colleague who intelligently and conversationally responds to your requests.

JOIN TO START

casetext	Meet CoCounsel \checkmark Why Casetext? \checkmark Who we serve \checkmark Resources	s ∨ Legacy Research	Pricing Log in	Free trial
	Meet your new Al legal as	ssistant		
	CoCounsel does document review, legal resea deposition preparation, and contract analysis in results you can trust.			
	Free trial			
	Which documents should I review?			
	Questions to answer from the documents Does the cautionary statement refer to drilling risks?)ō		
	Is the Bakken Basin mentioned?)ô		
	Get your answers Review Documents Sperch a Distribuse Legal Research Keino More Skill			



Ann Walsh Long, Director, Law Library

Supreme Court of Nevada Law Library awalshlong@nvcourts.nv.gov

AWL June 2023



E-DISCOVERY, TIPS AND TRICKS

Presented by:

Jon Holpuch HOLO Discovery



What is E-Discovery

 E-discovery, also known as electronic discovery, refers to the process of identifying, collecting, and producing electronically stored information (ESI) in response to a request for production in a legal proceeding. This can include emails, documents, social media posts, and other types of digital data.





NRCP 16.1

- Amended effective March 1, 2019
- Under the Nevada Rules of Civil Procedure, parties to a legal proceeding have a duty to preserve any ESI that may be relevant to the case. This means that they must take reasonable steps to prevent the destruction or alteration of any ESI that could be used as evidence in the case.
- In addition, the Nevada Rules of Civil Procedure require parties to disclose any ESI that is relevant to the case. This means that parties must produce ESI that is responsive to the other party's request for production, unless the ESI is privileged or otherwise protected from disclosure.



NRCP 16.1

- "Rule 16.1(b)(4) adopts the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure (FRCP) requirement that parties discuss the preservation of discoverable evidence, including electronically stored information, trade secrets and confidential information, including whether a confidentiality order or a motion for a protective order under Rule 26(c) is necessary." (nvbar.org)
- This is a good time to discuss production protocols.

ELECTRONIC DATA REFERENCE MODEL

Electronic Discovery Reference Model



ELECTRONIC DATA REFERENCE MODEL

Electronic Discovery Reference Model





DATA SOURCES

• Where can data be found?







CLOUD DATA SOURCES

• On the internet and in the cloud.



E-DISCOVERY GOALS



Cost Effective



IDENTIFY SOURCES

- List of key participants from the company
- Type of email system (exchange/cloud/pop)
- List of devices that they used (laptop/cell/desktop), make, model, serial numbers
- How old are these devices?
- What are the operating systems on the devices?
- Data retention policy (if any)
- Legal hold policy (if any)
- What programs are used to view the emails (outlook, thunderbird, etc.)?
- List of email accounts used
- List of active users during the relevant time period
- List of key participants personal email accounts
- Relevant time period
- List of all cloud accounts used
- List of all social media accounts
- List of internal messenger/chat applications
- List of servers, file shares, network storage devices
- List of External hard drives, thumb drives or other removeable media

PRESERVATION/LEGAL HOLD

The Parties represent that they have issued litigation hold notices to those custodians with data, and persons or entities responsible for maintenance of non-custodial data, which, based upon then-current information available, are reasonably likely to contain discoverable information.

PHYSICAL COLLECTION

 Chain of Custody preserved during collection

	Chain of Custody					
Case Information						
Case Name:						
HOLO Matter Number:						
Device Reference ID	Make	Model	Serial Number			
001						
002						
003						
004						
005						
005						
006						
007						

Device(s)		Received From	Received By	Purpose
	Date	Signature	Signature	
	Time	Print	Print	
	Date	Signature	Signature	
	Time	Print	Print	
	Date	Signature	Signature	
	Time	Print	Print	
	Date	Signature	Signature	
	Time	Print	Print	
	Date	Signature	Signature	
	Time	Print	Print	
	Date	Signature	Signature	
	Time	Print	Print	

3016 W. Charleston Blvd, Suite 170 Las Vegas, NV 89102 702.333.4321 holo-discovery.com



LAPTOPS/DESKTOPS

- Complete Forensic Image Created
 - By making a mirror image, or exact copy, sector by sector, of the hard disk
 - Most complete and defensible way to preserve
 - Allows analysis and possible recovery of deleted data



LAPTOPS/DESKTOPS

- Active File Collection / Logical Collection
 - Only files/folders actively available on the computer are collected
 - Will not include deleted data



- Information Available on Devices
 - Text messages/Chat Messages
 - Call History

•

- Photos/Videos/Audio
- Voice Mail
- Browser History
- Location Information
- Wi-Fi Hot Spot Connections
- App Information
- Deleted Data



MOBILE DEVICE PRESEREVATION

- Screenshot-only collection may be inadequate
- Commercial collection software available and more comprehensive
- We use:





WEB-BASED EMAIL & CLOUD APPLICATIONS

- Some email systems include e-discovery tools.
- Specialized software allows remote data collection
- Will require 2-factor authentication (client providing key codes to allow us remote access)
- Client privacy protected in various ways:
 - Temporary passwords
 - On-site collection


- Facebook, Instagram, Twitter, LinkedIn, YouTube, etc.
- Specialized software, remote collection
- 2-factor authentication
- Client privacy protected
 - Temp passwords, on-site collection
- Report includes:
 - Posts/comments
 - Photos/videos
 - Metadata

SELF COLLECTION – THE RISKS

• "Attorneys have a duty to oversee their clients' collection of information and documents, especially when ESI is involved, during the discovery process. Although clients can certainly be tasked with searching for, collecting, and producing discovery, it must be accomplished under the advice and supervision of counsel, or at least with counsel possessing sufficient knowledge of the process utilized by the client. Parties and clients, who are often lay persons, do not normally have the knowledge and expertise to understand their discovery obligations, to conduct appropriate searches, to collect responsive discovery, and then to fully produce it, especially when dealing with ESI, without counsel's guiding hand."

 Applicable case law informs that "self collection by a layperson of information on an electronic device is highly problematic and raises a real risk that data could be destroyed or corrupted."

• Most of our clients utilize some manner of data identification and self-collection on their cases. The issue comes down to oversight and supervision. The panelists admitted that, while self collection is not a best practice, it happens in most of the cases they see.

ELECTRONIC DATA REFERENCE MODEL



F



DATA PROCESSING

- 188,000,000 emails are sent every minute (Domo)
- Worldwide, there are 40 Zettabytes of data
 - That's 40,000,000,000,000,000,000,000 Bytes, or
 - 40 times the number of stars in the observable universe

• How can we process data in an efficient way?

DISCOVERY DATA PROCESSING -FILTERING

- Date Filters What is the relevant date range?
- Document Type Filters Emails, Office Documents, CAD
- De-Duplication
- Search Terms
- Email Threading
- Email Participant Lists

DATA PROCESSING – SEARCH TERMS

- The Enron data contains 182,170 documents.
- There is a custodian named Andrea Ring. How can we filter her emails?
 - Search for "*Ring*". This returns 769 documents, but may contain false positives.
 - Search for "Andrea" w/2 "Ring". This returns 244 documents.

DATA PROCESSING – METADATA

- Metadata is "data about data".
 - Information about files and documents
 - Dates and times (Last Modified Date, Sent Date)
 - Author/Sender/Recipients
 - Location information (GPS coordinates)
- During processing, metadata is extracted from documents and can be provided as part of productions

ELECTRONIC DATA REFERENCE MODEL







REVIEW

- How many documents to review?
 - Smaller sets can be reviewed as PDF files
 - Larger sets would require a review platform and/or teams to review
- Native Files vs. Image Files
 - Native files are typically smaller in size than image files, but may need to be reviewed in review platforms if you don't have the software
 - PDF image files can easily be reviewed from your computer
 - Tiff image files are best reviewed using a review platform

ELECTRONIC DATA REFERENCE MODEL



DATABASE DOCUMENT LIST VIEW

ii 🕫 🗟 *	Keyword Search 👻	Enter Search Terms					
Filter							V
	Bates Beg	Bates End	Unified Title	Date Sent	Email From	Email To	Email CC
 Temo Workspace 	Filter	Filter	Filter	(All) v	Filter	Filter	Filter
 Documents to Review 							
Already Reviewed	DEM0000001	DEM000001	RE: Companies and Areas	05/21/2001 3:48 PM	Forster David <david.forster@enron.co m></david.forster@enron.co 	Zipper Andy <andy.zipper@enron.co m></andy.zipper@enron.co 	
 Custodians Test Move 	DEM0000002	DEM000002	RE: Companies and Areas	05/21/2001 3:58 PM	Forster David <david.forster@enron.co m></david.forster@enron.co 	Zipper Andy <andy.zipper@enron.co m></andy.zipper@enron.co 	
 Production Documents 	DEM000003	DEM000003	FW: Recommended Offer by ICE for IPE Holdings	05/24/2001 11:27 AM	Piper Greg <greg.piper@enron.com ></greg.piper@enron.com 	Zipper Andy <andy.zipper@enron.co m></andy.zipper@enron.co 	Boyd Justin <justin.boyd@enron.com>; Brown Michael <michael.r.brown@enron.c om></michael.r.brown@enron.c </justin.boyd@enron.com>

DATABASE DOCUMENT AND CODING

━ 90% + "> 🖂 🗓 🔀 🖁 🗸 🖶 🖉 🕒	Search within Document Q	۲	Save & Next	Save	Cancel	First Pass 🔻			
From: Forster David <david forster@enron.com=""></david>		Q	First Pass Review						
Sent: Monday, May 21, 2001 3:49 PM To: Zipper Andy <andy.zipper@enron.com></andy.zipper@enron.com>			Control Number AZIPPER_0007291						
Subject: RE: Companies and Areas			Bates	Beg DEM	DEM0000001				
OK - we'll get on the Crude Oil list right away - and I'll touch base with John Nowlan.			Bates	End DEM	0000001				
I assume that Gas & Power is still an area we will hold off on for now?			Bates Beg Att	ttach DEMO000001					
Dave			Bates End Att	tach DEM	h DEM0000001				
Original Message From: Zipper, Andy Sent: Monday, May 21, 2001 1:36 PM To: Forster, David			Respon Designa	tion	Responsive Non-Respons	ive			
Subject: RE: Companies and Areas I would like to add Energy Trading					 Needs Further Review Technical Issue 				
with two subset's:				◯ test					
Gas & Power Crude Oil and Refined Products				Mana	age				
I would particuality like to talk to every Crude and REfined supply and trading organization out t	thema		For Further Rev	view					
I would particularly like to tak to every crude and scrined supply and usuing organization out	mere.		Privilege Designa			lient Privilege			
ERM Euron Email Data Set has been produced in EML, PST and NSF format by ZL Technologies, Inc. This Data Set is licensed under a Cre Commons Attribution 3.0 United States License < <u>http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0/us</u> >. To provide attribution, please cite to "ZL Technologies, Inc. (<u>http://www.zlti.com</u>)." *********				· · ·	Attorney Client Communication Attorney Work Product Manage				
			Confiden Designat	ntial O	I Confidential				
				\bigcirc	Attorneys' Eyes Only				
						Subject to Protective (
				⊖ F Mana		ential Subject to Prot	ective Order		
			Attorney Rev	view					

Comments



- Email Threading
 - Groups emails by their conversation.
 - The top-most emails and emails with attachments are known as "Inclusive Emails". These can be reviewed.
 - "Non-Inclusive Emails" can be set aside or produced along with the inclusive ones.



Email Threading





- Near-Duplication
 - Near Duplication compares the text of documents and generates a similarity score.
 - While the this can be useful for identifying similar documents, it is not as accurate as a true de-duplication.



- Near-Duplication
 - Consider the phrases:
 - "Hello I am Sam. Do you like Green Eggs and Ham? I do like Green Eggs and Ham."
 - "Hello I am Sam. Do you like Green Eggs and Ham? I do not like Green Eggs and Ham."
 - The first phrase is 95.18% similar to the second phrase using the Damerau-Levenshtein algorithm.

A.I. ASSISTED REVIEW

- One or more reviewers code documents for relevance.
- Artificial intelligence is then used to apply the same coding decisions to similar documents.
- In recent cases, we have used the following process for TAR:
 - Reviewing firm codes a round of documents for relevance and privilege.
 - Non-privileged documents are sent to opposing counsel for review and confirmation that coding decisions are correct.
 - Assisted Review ran against entire set of documents to code for relevance.
 - Additional rounds repeated as needed
 - Reviewing firm performs final round of privilege review, and all relevant, non-privileged documents produced to opposition.

ELECTRONIC DATA REFERENCE MODEL





- Establish Protocol Early in Case (NRCP 16 Conference)
- NRCP Rule 34.a(1)(A) "... to produce ... any designated documents or electronically stored information ... stored in any medium from which information can be obtained either directly or, if necessary, after translation by the responding party into a reasonably usable form."
- Native Files vs. Image Files
- Native productions are more cost effective
- Image files can be stamped to identify each page of each document
- We recommend reviewing native files, but producing image files



- PDF
 - Works well with small productions (1,000 documents or less)
- Images with Load Files
 - Recommended for larger productions
- Natives with Load Files
 - Recommended for larger productions
 - No Bates stamps. The file is given a unique number similar to a Bates stamp.
 - Special care must be given if files are used in deposition or trial such as stamping the document on the page level using the unique number and adding .0001, .0002 and so on on the page level.



ESI PROTOCOL

2	I. IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, the Court, having considered the positions of the parties
-	
3	regarding matters affecting the discovery of electronically-stored information
4	("eDiscovery") hereby orders compliance with the following procedures regarding the
5	search for and production of electronically stored information ("ESI") and other documents
6	in this case, which the Court finds appropriate.SCOPE
7	Nothing herein shall enlarge or affect the proper scope of discovery in this case, nor shall
8	anything herein imply that any documents or ESI collected or produced under the terms of this
9	protocol are properly discoverable, relevant, or admissible in this action or any other proceeding,
10	whether regulatory or judicial or other.

11 This Order shall apply to all ESI produced by the Parties in this action and to productions of 12 ESI by third parties in response to subpoenas. Any request for documents directed to non-parties must 13 be accompanied by a copy of this Order. Nothing in this Order shall limit the right of a non-party to 14 seek modification of this Order if its terms are unreasonably burdensome in comparison to the volume 15 of data to be produced. Such modification may be obtained by stipulation with the parties or by motion 16 to this Court.

17 II. DEFINITIONS

18 The following definitions will apply in this Order:

"Bates Number" means a unique alphanumeric identifier associated with every physical sheet
of paper, electronic file, electronically stored Tiff/PDF image, or other tangible thing, consisting of:
(1) an alphabetic portion identifying the Producing Party; and (2) a numeric portion incremented
according to a scheme defined at the Producing Party's discretion to ensure that the alphanumeric
identifier for each physical sheet of paper, electronic file, electronically stored Tiff/PDF image, or
other tangible thing is unique. The alphanumeric identifier shall be no more than eighteen (18)
characters in length.

26 "ESI" means any information that was created, manipulated, communicated, stored and best
 27 utilized in digital form, requiring the use of computer hardware and software including writings,
 28 drawings, graphs, charts, photographs, sound recordings, images, and other data or data

DISPUTES INVOLVING SPOLIATION OR PRODUCTION

• Consider establishing a Third Party Protocol

- Often we are listed as a neutral third party to ensure all data is collected, handled, and produced in a proper format.
- Save on costs.
- Defines search terms and parameters with all parties.
- Collections performed in a proper format.
- Consistent production protocol and documentation.

FORENSIC INSPECTION PROTOCOL



Protocol for Digital Forensic Inspection

I. Forensic Inspector

On behalf of the parties, HOLO Discovery ("HOLO") will conduct a forensic acquisition of both the Plaintiff's and Defendants' digital data storage devices and extract the agreed-upon file(s) utilizing digital forensic software and analysis.

II. Confidentiality

As an officer of the Court, HOLO's inspection of electronic media will not waive any applicable privilege or doctrine or principle assuring the confidentiality of information contained therein. HOLO will maintain all information in the strictest confidence. No information learned by HOLO shall be disclosed except pursuant to the terms of this Order, other direction by the Court, or as business or legally necessary to complete the electronic discovery protocol.

III. Devices

Parties will list the potentially relevant electronic devices including laptops, desktops, cellular devices, servers, shared files, external hard drives, billing, and project-based applications, cloud accounts, etc. Counsel will meet and confer and direct HOLO on which devices they would like imaged.

IV. Search Criteria

Parties will agree on an initial set of search terms to be applied to filter the data for relevant information. A search term keyword hit list will be circulated amongst the appropriate parties in which counsel will meet and confer to determine if the criteria for certain terms need to be modified.

IV. Acquisition and Analysis

HOLO Discovery uses a variety of forensic imaging tools based on the status of the devices to collect. The imaging tools that HOLO uses are Tableau Forensic Imager, FTK Imager, Sumuri Paladin, OSForensics, OSF Clone, and others as needed. When possible, HOLO Discovery uses hardware and software-based write-blocking tools.

HOLO will then analyze the hard drives, per the agreement of the parties. Items potentially included in the analysis are as follows:

- Recover deleted data from email container files and unallocated space.
- Generate a browser history report to identify any data that had been uploaded from a browser or if a web-based email was being used.
- · Search the forensic images for the history of web-based email. Attempt to recover any emails.
- Search for any cloud services installed on the computers (Dropbox, etc.).
- Create a list of recently accessed USB devices.
- Search the Jump Lists for a list of recently and frequently accessed documents.
- Apply agreed-upon search criteria
- Export data responsive data to native format

3016 W. Charleston Blvd, Suite 170 | Las Vegas, NV 89102 702.333.4321 | holo-discovery.com



FINAL THOUGHTS

- When possible, use NRCP rules to determine production of ESI.
- Encourage or require early conferencing.
- If needed, let the parties educate you about the technology.
- To the extent possible, let the parties work out their own agreements.
- Rule quickly on ESI disputes.
- Where costs can be an issue, consider cost-shifting or cost-sharing among parties.
- Think ahead to how the requested ESI will be used in the courtroom, and plan ahead for the outcome.



E-DISCOVERY, TIPS AND TRICKS

- Questions?
- Comments?

Jon Holpuch HOLO Discovery